Scoring Protocol for Bartlett Experiment 1
(the War of the Ghosts)

The key to scoring the narrative recalls is to use the original as a reference; hence the propositions in the original are numbered, and those numbers appear on the scoring sheet. The idea is to look for each proposition from the WOG in the subject's narrative recall.

Once the reference is found, record the corresponding reference number from the subject's recall. (Note: a particular subject proposition may represent one or more propositions from the WOG, therefore, it's OK to reference the same proposition more than once.) **If the WOG proposition is missing from the recall entirely, circle "O" under Level 1 to indicate that it's been omitted**.

If am entirely new or out of place proposition is seen in the subject's narrative, record it in the second section of the score sheet marked appropriately (and explained below). Out of place here is defined as a whole proposition that came from another episode of the story, and not the one being scored. The episodes are demarcated by the WOG lines 1-18 for the 1st episode, 19-28 for the 2nd, and 29-42 for the 3rd. Movements of minor elements (the parts of factual units that make up a proposition) from one episode to another are handled under the Level III category **PLACE** explicated below.

Level I

The idea here is to evaluate the degree to which the WOG proposition is represented in the subject's narrative. There are three categories of responses at this level. circle only one.

X = **exactly correct** (word for word).
E = **essentially correct**; some omission or moderate distortion, but on the whole an accurate statement.
I = **incorrect**; some elements or details accurate or some general similarity, but on the whole the proposition is now incorrect; at least one major distortion.
O = **omitted**; as stated above.

Level II

Here the kind or error is specified. Error is generally assumed to exist for **E** or **I** responses at Level I, but if the error in an **E** response is a minor change of phrasing that does not add to or modify the meaning, you may decide to not circle either category here. However, if something substantive is added, subtracted, or changed, you must circle one or both as appropriate.

Omission = This category mainly applies to items that were labeled "**E**", but may also

apply to "**I**" items. Circle this if there is some omission or loss of detail, but there is not (necessarily) any distortion. Specifically, **detail is omitted, but nothing is added** to the statement.

DISTORT = This category applies to anything that modifies or changes the meaning of the proposition as it is recalled. Here, generally, some element is added or changed such that the meaning is modified a little (as in **E**) or a lot (as in **I**). Be somewhat conservative here; don't give the subject the benefit of the doubt. For e.g.: changing "I have no arrows" to "We have no arrows" constitutes a minor distortion because we are scoring for exact reproduction. However, omissions, changes in plurality that do not change the essential meaning, and minor changes in phrasing not referred to below are not scored as distorted. In contrast, changing "canoe" to "boat" is a distortion; see below for more on this change. One type of distortion specified here is relatively mild: the **MOD** category designates a re-phrasing of the proposition that involves some minor change in the meaning or significant re-phrasing which maintains the meaning but is nevertheless distinctly different (see below). If the change is due largely to omission of information but not much re-phrasing (e.g.: enough re-phrasing to maintain correct grammatical structure given the deletion) do not score the proposition as distorted.

Level III

Given that the **DISTORT** category was circled at Level II, the type of distortion should now be specified.

NORM = Normalization. This distortion involves changing an element in a proposition from the actual thing to an element that is more in line with what you (as a member or this social group) judge to be the normal experience or conception of the world. Often such normalization involves interpretation that is by definition reasonable to us: but the key is that it is not what was stated in the story, rather it is an interpretation based on common experience.

For example, changing:
"canoe" to [boat,]
"river" to [ocean]or [lake] or [sea] (because of the seal hunting)
"town" to [village.]
"sick" to [hurt], [pain], etc. (because when you're shot, sick is an odd way to describe it).
a proper place name to [village] (because it's called a town)
"day" to [night] (because hunting is unusual at night).
"sun rose" to [sunset] or [dawn] or [morning]
"something black" to [black liquid]

"men" to [boys]
"foggy and calm" to [dark and foggy]
"hunting seals" to [fishing]
"log" to [bushes]

MOD = A change in the phrasing of a proposition that does not add new information (as in **INFER**) and does not change into something more common (as in **NORM**) but nevertheless uses a distinctly different phrasing or involves an accurate summarizing statement (especially a collapse of multiple propositions into one). This category includes changes in tense and subject that change the meaning minimally.

E.g.: replacing lines 7-8 with: "A canoe with five men came up"

Also, this category specifies replacing a particular element with a synonym (when the replacement is not a case of normalization or inference).

For e.g.: if "canoe" was changed to ["boat,"] but somewhere else in the narrative the word "canoe" was used, thus it is possible to infer that subject knows that it is a canoe and not a boat, but just labeled it such.

Or for E.g.: replacing "the sun rose" with ["the sun came up"]. (Note that replacing "the sun rose" with ["morning"] would be a case of normalization).

INFER = A distortion that involves a change or *addition* to the proposition such that what was not stated before but was implied or can be inferred from the story is now stated explicitly.

E.g.: ["They told him he was hit by an arrow"] instead of the correct "that Indian has been hit" where the antecedent of Indian is uncertain in a verbatim recall and arrow, inferred before, is made explicit.

.E.g.: Adding the following clause (noted here in brackets) to the phrase "the other man went [with the men in the canoe]" .

Or, similarly: "You can go [if you want to]"

Or: "Many [Indians] died on both sides"

"Many were killed [or injured]"

PLACE = Where an element (but not a whole proposition – see above) is imported from another episode within the story (again, see above).

E.g.: using the term "Indian" in the 1st episode when it only appears in the 2nd episode.

E.g.: Mentioning "Kalama" (place where they fought the war) in the 1st episode when it is only named in the 2nd.

E.g.: In 2nd episode saying "many were killed [on both sides]" when the phrase [on both sides] comes from the third episode.

OUT   =   An element that is essentially an intrusion from some unknown source.

E.g.: " something black [flew] out of his mouth"

Entirely New or Out of Place Propositions

Here major distortions, that is, entire propositions that have been moved to a different episode or are made up (not just a summary) are scored. The basic analysis is like Level III above.

First, specify in which episode it occurred (**BEGIN, MID, END**).

Next, specify the nature of the intrusion:

- an inference – **INFER/THEME** – (something made up to fill in a gap or that can reasonably be assumed to have occurred but no description is in the WOG text), or something thematically the same — (fits the general theme of the WOG but not an inference).

- a normative inference – **NORMALIZATION** – (replaces some proposition in the story with something that is more normative. E.G.: replacing a supernatural proposition with a more "normal" one, as in saying the Indian's wounds were visible and real).

- a statement from another episode in the story – **STORY/PLACE** – (see above).

- a proposition of unknown origin – **OUT**.

Finally, specify the degree of detail provided, from vague to elaborative on a 5 pt. scale.

The War of the Ghosts

1. One night two young men from Egulac went down to the river to hunt seals,
2. and while they were there it became foggy and calm.
3. Then they heard war-cries,
4. and they thought: "Maybe this is a war-party."
5. They escaped to the shore,
6. and hid behind a log.
7. Now canoes came up,
8. and they heard the noise of paddles,
9. and saw one canoe coming up to them.
10. There were five men in the canoe,
11. and they said: "What do you think? We wish to take you along.
12. We are going up the river to make war on the people."
13. One of the young men said: "I have no arrows."
14. "Arrows are in the canoe," they said.
15. "I will not go along.
16. I might be killed.
17. My relatives do not know where I have gone.
18. But you," he said, turning to the other, "may go with them."
19. So one of the young men went,
20. but the other returned home.
21. And the warriors went on up the river to a town on the other side of Kalama.
22. The people came down to the water,
23. and they began to fight,
24. and many were killed.
25. But presently the young man heard one of the warriors say: "Quick, let us go home: that Indian has been hit."
26. Now he thought: "Oh they are ghosts."
27. He did not feel sick,
28. but they said he had been shot.
29. So the canoes went back to Egulac,
30. and the young man went ashore to his house, and made a fire.
31. And he told everybody and said: "Behold I accompanied the ghosts, and we went to fight.
32. Many of our fellows were killed,
33. and many of those who attacked us were killed.
34. They said I was hit,
35. and I did not feel sick."
36. He told it all,
37. and then became quiet.
38. When the sun rose he fell down.
39. Something black came out of his mouth.
40. His face became contorted.
41. The people jumped up and cried.
42. He was dead.

RECALL AND DISTORTION

PROP #	SUB REF #	Level I Category (pick one)	Level II Kind of Error (pick one or both)	Level III Distortion Type / Count (as appropriate)
1		X E I O	OMISS DISTORT>	MOD NORM INFER PLACE OUT
2		X E I O	OMISS DISTORT>	MOD NORM INFER PLACE OUT
3		X E I O	OMISS DISTORT>	MOD NORM INFER PLACE OUT
4		X E I O	OMISS DISTORT>	MOD NORM INFER PLACE OUT
5		X E I O	OMISS DISTORT>	MOD NORM INFER PLACE OUT
6		X E I O	OMISS DISTORT>	MOD NORM INFER PLACE OUT
7		X E I O	OMISS DISTORT>	MOD NORM INFER PLACE OUT
8		X E I O	OMISS DISTORT>	MOD NORM INFER PLACE OUT
9		X E I O	OMISS DISTORT>	MOD NORM INFER PLACE OUT
10		X E I O	OMISS DISTORT>	MOD NORM INFER PLACE OUT
11		X E I O	OMISS DISTORT>	MOD NORM INFER PLACE OUT
12		X E I O	OMISS DISTORT>	MOD NORM INFER PLACE OUT
13		X E I O	OMISS DISTORT>	MOD NORM INFER PLACE OUT
14		X E I O	OMISS DISTORT>	MOD NORM INFER PLACE OUT
15		X E I O	OMISS DISTORT>	MOD NORM INFER PLACE OUT
16		X E I O	OMISS DISTORT>	MOD NORM INFER PLACE OUT

17		X	E	I	O	OMISS	DISTORT>	MOD	NORM	INFER	PLACE	OUT
18		X	E	I	O	OMISS	DISTORT>	MOD	NORM	INFER	PLACE	OUT
19		X	E	I	O	OMISS	DISTORT>	MOD	NORM	INFER	PLACE	OUT
20		X	E	I	O	OMISS	DISTORT>	MOD	NORM	INFER	PLACE	OUT
21		X	E	I	O	OMISS	DISTORT>	MOD	NORM	INFER	PLACE	OUT
22		X	E	I	O	OMISS	DISTORT>	MOD	NORM	INFER	PLACE	OUT
23		X	E	I	O	OMISS	DISTORT>	MOD	NORM	INFER	PLACE	OUT
24		X	E	I	O	OMISS	DISTORT>	MOD	NORM	INFER	PLACE	OUT
25		X	E	I	O	OMISS	DISTORT>	MOD	NORM	INFER	PLACE	OUT
26		X	E	I	O	OMISS	DISTORT>	MOD	NORM	INFER	PLACE	OUT
27		X	E	I	O	OMISS	DISTORT>	MOD	NORM	INFER	PLACE	OUT
28		X	E	I	O	OMISS	DISTORT>	MOD	NORM	INFER	PLACE	OUT
29		X	E	I	O	OMISS	DISTORT>	MOD	NORM	INFER	PLACE	OUT
30		X	E	I	O	OMISS	DISTORT>	MOD	NORM	INFER	PLACE	OUT
31		X	E	I	O	OMISS	DISTORT>	MOD	NORM	INFER	PLACE	OUT
32		X	E	I	O	OMISS	DISTORT>	MOD	NORM	INFER	PLACE	OUT
33		X	E	I	O	OMISS	DISTORT>	MOD	NORM	INFER	PLACE	OUT
34		X	E	I	O	OMISS	DISTORT>	MOD	NORM	INFER	PLACE	OUT
35		X	E	I	O	OMISS	DISTORT>	MOD	NORM	INFER	PLACE	OUT

36		X E I O	OMISS DISTORT>	MOD NORM INFER PLACE OUT
37		X E I O	OMISS DISTORT>	MOD NORM INFER PLACE OUT
38		X E I O	OMISS DISTORT>	MOD NORM INFER PLACE OUT
39		X E I O	OMISS DISTORT>	MOD NORM INFER PLACE OUT
40		X E I O	OMISS DISTORT>	MOD NORM INFER PLACE OUT
41		X E I O	OMISS DISTORT>	MOD NORM INFER PLACE OUT
42		X E I O	OMISS DISTORT>	MOD NORM INFER PLACE OUT

TOTAL RECALL AND DISTORTION

X E I O OMISS DISTORT		MOD NORM INFER PLACE OUT

Subject #   **Recall:** **1ˢᵗ** **2ⁿᵈ**   **Scorer:**

ENTIRELY NEW PROPOSITIONS

Sub Ref #	Position (circle one)	Kind of Intrusion (circle one)	Level of Detail (circle one)
	BEGIN MID END	INFER/THEME NORMAL STORY/PLACE OUT	VAGUE ELAB 1 2 3 4 5
	BEGIN MID END	INFER/THEME NORMAL STORY/PLACE OUT	VAGUE ELAB 1 2 3 4 5
	BEGIN MID END	INFER/THEME NORMAL STORY/PLACE OUT	VAGUE ELAB 1 2 3 4 5
	BEGIN MID END	INFER/THEME NORMAL STORY/PLACE OUT	VAGUE ELAB 1 2 3 4 5
	BEGIN MID END	INFER/THEME NORMAL STORY/PLACE OUT	VAGUE ELAB 1 2 3 4 5
	BEGIN MID END	INFER/THEME NORMAL STORY/PLACE OUT	VAGUE ELAB 1 2 3 4 5
	BEGIN MID END	INFER/THEME NORMAL STORY/PLACE OUT	VAGUE ELAB 1 2 3 4 5
	BEGIN MID END	INFER/THEME NORMAL STORY/PLACE OUT	VAGUE ELAB 1 2 3 4 5
	BEGIN MID END	INFER/THEME NORMAL STORY/PLACE OUT	VAGUE ELAB 1 2 3 4 5

TOTAL NEW PROPOSITIONS

BEGIN MID END	INFER/THEME NORMAL STORY/PLACE OUT	ELAB SCORE